NORTON ROSE FULBRIGHT

The Big Read Book series Volume 10 Presenting your evidence in the small claims court

January 2023

Contents

An Introduction to the court	04
Familiarise yourself with the process	04
Prepare thoroughly	05
Bring along your evidence	05
Identify the key issues	06
Practise	06
Attending court on the day	06
Ensure your witness attends court	06
Your witness	07
How the proceedings work	07

Dear reader

Welcome to Volume 10 of Norton Rose Fulbright's The Big Read Book Series on presenting your evidence in the small claims court.

You can access soft copies of our previous volumes at <u>https://www.nortonrosefulbright.com/en-za/knowledge/</u> <u>publications/b2568c43/the-big-read-book-series</u> and also keep regularly updated on developments in insurance law including both South African and other judgments by subscribing to our Financial Institution Legal Snapshot: <u>www.financialinstitutionslegalsnapshot.com/</u>

An online version of this publication, and previous volumes, is available at <u>https://www.nortonrosefulbright.com/en-za/knowledge/publications/b2568c43/the-big-read-book-series</u>.

You can access Volume 1, which covers South African insurance judgments of 2018, here.

For more about avoidance and cancellation of non-life insurance policies see Volume 2 of The Big Read Book Series, here.

- <u>Volume 3</u> is a guide to indemnity and reinstatement value conditions.
- <u>Volume 4</u> collates South African insurance judgments of 2019.
- <u>Volume 5</u> is the comic book edition for avoidance and cancellation of non-life insurance policies. A must read.
- Volume 6 is on drones.
- <u>Volume 7</u> covers South African insurance judgments of 2020.

- <u>Volume 8</u> is an overview of the South African law of marine insurance
- <u>Volume 9</u> is a review of South African insurance judgments of 2021

You can also keep up with developments in insurance law including South African judgments and instructive judgments from other countries by subscribing to our blog.

www.financialinstitutionslegalsnapshot.com/

An Introduction to the court

In the small claims court, matters are resolved speedily, inexpensively and informally. As a litigant, whether you are the plaintiff (the claimant) or the defendant (the party opposing the claim), you must conduct your own case without legal representation.

Proceedings are inquisitorial, so the Commissioner plays an active role in supervising the presentation of the evidence by assisting the parties and the witnesses in presenting their evidence. The inquisitorial system is a method of adjudication in which the Commissioner endeavours to ascertain the facts by questioning the parties, weighing the evidence, and arriving at a decision. The Commissioner will actively steer the parties to determine the facts. The Commissioner is not a passive recipient of information.

That does not mean that you can sit back, relax, and expect the Commissioner to make your case or your defence for you. The Commissioner will have read any papers filed in court setting out the claim or the defence. As a party to the action, you are best placed to ensure that all of the relevant facts and evidence are placed before the court. So, you must prepare accordingly and thoroughly. If you have seen the TV series, "Judge Judy" or "Judge Rinder", which are American and British television series representative of the small claims court process in those jurisdictions, they will give you a sense of how the process works but with some added theatrics.

The rules regulating matters in respect of the Small Claims Court as at 7 October 2022 can be found here.

Familiarise yourself with the process

If you are not a regular litigant in the small claims court (and hopefully you are not) and you have the opportunity to do so, it is a good idea to sit in and listen to proceedings in the small claims court closest to you before your trial date. It does not matter if that is not the court that will hear your case. That time will be well spent in giving you a sense of the court procedure, what type of questions the Commissioner asks, and to see what the parties in those cases do well or badly so that you hopefully do not repeat their mistakes.

Make sure you that you are at the court on the appointed date well before the time when your case will be called, so that you can have ample time to find the specific court, sit down, find your breath and meet up with any witnesses you have arranged to attend. Do not be guided by your favourite television lawyer series. You do not get to "put it to the witness" or deliver an impassioned emotional speech to the jury. Television programmes usually represent the adversarial system where opposing parties gather and present evidence and arguments to the presiding officer. That is not the process adopted in the small claims court.

You do not get to cross-examine a witness. You can suggest questions that the Commissioner can put to the other party or their witnesses or with the Commissioner's permission and, through the Commissioner, direct questions to that party or witnesses.

Prepare thoroughly

You should prepare your case thoroughly. Practice your presentation before a friend or family member. If you have no friends or family members, practice in front of a mirror. Identify the key facts of the case and ensure that your case is set out simply, clearly, and in chronological order.

It is especially useful to practice with a friend or family member not familiar with the claim, and to use them to comment on whether, on your presentation, they could easily understand your case or defence. You need to communicate your story simply and clearly. If they are confused, it is likely that the Commissioner will also be confused. Do not complicate or confuse your case with irrelevant facts or evidence. You only have "one bite at the cherry". There is no appeal of the judgment if the Commissioner gets the decision wrong on the facts. Bear in mind that any evidence having reasonable value to prepare your case may be offered, but also that the Commissioner may refuse to accept irrelevant or repetitious evidence or arguments. Usually proceedings take place in open court. This means that members of the public, including the media, can attend.

Bring along your evidence

If you have any documentation pertinent to the claim or defence, make sure you take the original documents to your hearing. If you do not have access to the original documents, you need to bring along, if possible, certified copies of the documentation, and ensure you have extra copies to provide to your opponent. Often parties arrive at the small claims court and tell the Commissioner that they do not have the documents with them. That may result in a postponement of the case or the matter being determined without the benefit of that documentation.

If you are the plaintiff, make sure you bring along a copy of your letter of demand and proof of registered posting, or an affidavit (that is a statement sworn to under oath to God or a secular affirmation before a Commissioner of oaths) in which you set out how you personally delivered the letter of demand to your opponent. Also, bring a copy of the summons as issued with the court date and proof of proper service of the summons by the Sheriff on the defendant by way of a Sheriff's Return of Service of the summons by the Sheriff or your affidavit confirming personal service on the defendant. If, as a defendant, you have delivered a plea, which is a statement of defence, or other papers, bring along a copy with the proof of delivery of the plea to your opponent.

The same applies to any form of written contract where that is in dispute. If the matter relates, for example, to a lease, bring the written lease. If one of the issues is whether payments were made or received, bring along certified copies of the relevant bank statements for the applicable period to demonstrate that, for example, no relevant payment was received in your bank account for the appropriate period or to show, for example, that a payment was made into the opponent's bank account. Bring along invoices, receipts and proof of payment, where that is an issue.

It is useful to be able to present a few alternative quotations for repairs to vehicles or other assets in relation to which you claim damages. If you have an audio or video recording of any evidence bring that to court and ensure that you have a device to play the recording. Make sure that any recordings are audible and if possible bring along a transcript of the material aspects of that evidence. If you have physical evidence, for example, damaged clothes, if you are claiming against a laundry, bring those to court rather than photographs of the damage. Obviously, in the case of damage to a car or a house, evidence by way of appropriate photographs and video recordings is appropriate. The person who took those photographs or video recordings should give evidence in court or by way of affidavit as to when they took the photographs or video recording.

Identify the key issues

Bear in mind that as the plaintiff, you bear the burden of proof to establish your case on a balance of probabilities. Ordinarily the rule is that the party who makes the allegation must prove it.

You must prove your case that the defendant has done something that makes them liable to you for damages. Think about what elements of the dispute are not in contention. You do not have to spend a lot of time on that in presenting your case.

Think about what is in dispute and how you will deal with that in evidence. What objective evidence, such as bank accounts, invoices, receipts and written contracts, photographs, messages and recordings are there to present to the court to substantiate your version or to gainsay a version that may be presented by your opponent? What evidence will your opponent present to challenge your case?

Practise

When practising the presentation of your case for a friend or family member ask them to play "Devil's Advocate" and to ask questions and challenge your case. This is the one time where they can play out their lawyer TV series fantasies and cross-examine you to ensure that you have thought of everything you need to present to the court.

Attending court on the day

Ensure your witness attends court

If you have witnesses who will assist your case, ask them to agree attend to court on the designated day. There is no mechanism for compelling their attendance so you will need to ask a favour of the witness. If you are the plaintiff, when you go the clerk of the court to issue the summons, you can probably choose the court date so choose a date when you and your witnesses are available.

As a defendant, as soon as you receive the summons with the court date, notify your witnesses and ask them to confirm their availability. If you think a witness is key to your case and not available on the court date, contact your opponent immediately and see if you can agree to postpone to a date convenient to both parties and all their witnesses. If your opponent refuses to agree to that arrangement and you can show to the court that the witness is material to your case, take along to court on the trial day, copies of your correspondence in that regard, in whatever format, to show the Commissioner that despite your best efforts, your opponent would not agree another date. This will assist you in securing a postponement.

Do not just fail to arrive at court. You must be in court at the appointed date and time for the trial otherwise, you risk dismissal of your claim or default judgment against you.

If you cannot have a witness attend court, obtain an affidavit that you can present to the court. It would be useful if the affidavit tells the court why the witness is unable to attend at court and then deals with the particular issues on which they are able to give evidence.

Your witness

The witness giving testimony (by way of affidavit or in person in court) should give evidence only in respect of facts of which they have personal and direct knowledge. The formal rules of evidence do not apply. Commissioners can accept hearsay evidence (in other words, evidence that is reliant on the truth of someone who is not present at court to give evidence). The Commissioner will take into account that such evidence is not always particularly persuasive or necessarily reliable. Therefore, it does not usually assist to have a witness who says person A told them that they saw X, Y and Z happen.

You may need expert witnesses to give evidence about the nature and amount of damages. For example, a panel beater for a motor car or an electrician or a builder. They may not be willing to attend court without being paid for their attendance. You cannot recover those costs from the other parties.

An alternative would be to obtain an affidavit from that expert witness.

How the proceedings work

Proceedings in the small claims court are usually conducted in English and Afrikaans but you and your witnesses are entitled to give evidence in a language in which you are comfortable and certainly in any one of the official languages of the country. As soon as you know the court date and if you are giving evidence in a language other than English, contact the clerk of the court to ensure that on the day of the trial there will be an interpreter available for the language of your choice. You do not pay for the services of the interpreter as the States provides the interpreter. If your language is not an official language or an official language not commonly spoken in the town where the court sits, for example, French, it is unlikely that there will be an appropriate interpreter at the Court without prior arrangement. To avoid a postponement, contact the clerk of the court and make an arrangement for the attendance of the relevant interpreter as far in advance of your court date as possible. The interpreter should not have any relationship with any of the parties or witnesses.

The Commissioner (who acts like a Judge) should be addressed as "Commissioner". They are not "Your Ladyship", "Your Worship", "Your Honour" or "Your Holiness". "Commissioner" is the title whether the Commissioner is male or female. However, do not worry too much about how you address the Commissioner. Commissioners are used to being called all sort of names but of course, not rude ones! At all times, be respectful to the Commissioner, your opponent, and to your and their witnesses.

There is no particular dress code for the court but do dress to show to the Commissioner that you take both the court and your case seriously. You need not, for example, wear a jacket and tie. However, arriving to defend yourself in a T-shirt, shorts and slops may suggest that you do not take the process seriously. At the same time, dress comfortably. You do not want to sit in court distracted by new and scratchy clothes or shoes that are giving you blisters. In winter months be warmly dressed as it can be quite chilly in the courtroom.

Your dress and conduct should at all times maintain the dignity of the court. Do not swear or use any inappropriate or offensive language or gestures. Too much emotion is seldom helpful to getting the facts across.

You may be a little nervous when you first stand up to address the court. Being properly prepared with the comfort of having practised your presentation together with having the relevant documentation and witnesses present in court will assist in making your butterflies a mild flutter, rather than a frantic pounding, of wings.

Donald Dinnie

January 2023 Donald is a long-standing Commissioner of the small claims court in Johannesburg.

For more information go to: http://www.justice.gov.za/scc/



Donald Dinnie Director, Johannesburg Tel +27 11 685 8847 donald.dinnie@nortonrosefulbright.com

NORTON ROSE FULBRIGHT

Norton Rose Fulbright is a global law firm. We provide the world's preeminent corporations and financial institutions with a full business law service. We have more than 3700 lawyers and other legal staff based in Europe, the United States, Canada, Latin America, Asia, Australia, Africa and the Middle East.

Law around the world

nortonrosefulbright.com

Norton Rose Fulbright Verein, a Swiss verein, helps coordinate the activities of Norton Rose Fulbright members but does not itself provide legal services to clients. Norton Rose Fulbright has offices in more than 50 cities worldwide, including London, Houston, New York, Toronto, Mexico City, Hong Kong, Sydney and Johannesburg. For more information, see nortonrosefulbright.com/legal-notices. The purpose of this communication is to provide information as to developments in the law. It does not contain a full analysis of the law nor does it constitute an opinion of any Norton Rose Fulbright entity on the points of law discussed. You must take specific legal advice on any particular matter which concerns you. If you require any advice or further information, please speak to your usual contact at Norton Rose Fulbright.

© Norton Rose Fulbright LLP. Extracts may be copied provided their source is acknowledged. 48582_SA - 1/23